Public Private Community Partnership in Ngebel Lake Tourism Development, Ponorogo Regency

Nikmatus Sholikhah, M. Husni Tamrin*

Universitas Hang Tuah, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

Tourism development is one of the priority sectors in a country because the influence of tourism is able to drive economic growth and become the country's largest foreign exchange earner. In developing tourism, the government has entered into partnerships such as that carried out by the Ponorogo Regency Government with the Moroccan International Group Of Development, Technologies And Construction Companies (GDTC) and the Ngebel Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS) as the government's effort to develop Ngebel Lake tourism. The purpose of this research is to describe and analyze the characteristics of the Public, Private, and Community Partnership (PPCP) in the development of tourism in Ngebel Ponorogo Regency as well as the supporting and inhibiting factors. The method used is descriptive qualitative with data collection techniques through observation, interviews, and documentation. The data analysis technique uses data collection, data reduction, data display and verification. The results of this study found that the partnership between DISBUDPARPORA Ponorogo Regency, GDTC International Morocco and POKDARWIS Ngebel has not gone well, there are still obstacles between the government and private parties and in the budget that was initially submitted by the private party, they switched to using the APBD budget with government problems, which did not immediately make BUMD a requirement for disbursement of funds from the private sector. Therefore, it is necessary to improve the characteristics of successful partnerships so that stakeholders can improve themselves before collaborating.

Keywords: Development, Partnership, Tourism, Ngebel Lake, Ponorogo

INTRODUCTION

The tourism sector economically makes a real contribution to obtaining the country's foreign exchange income, regional original income and the income of people who participate in developed tourism businesses (Rizkiyah et al., 2019). Another reason is that the tourism sector can become a bridge for providing jobs where people directly work in the tourism industry and indirectly benefit from tourism (Cooper et al., in Darwis & Junaid, 2016). Tourism is also one way of preserving natural and cultural resources in a destination. This encourages the government in each country to promote development in the tourism sector. Tourism development covers the social, economic, political, security and cultural fields (Sharpley in (Chamidah et al., 2020). Regardless of all aspects of the number of tourist destinations and existing tourism potential, tourism development must be carried out based on four criteria, namely 1) based on the results of deliberation and consensus among all stakeholders; 2) must provide benefits to the community; 3) based on the principles of a...
healthy environment and ecology, as well as not contradicting the social, cultural, and religious traditions of the local population; and 4) does not place the community in a marginalized position (Mahardhani, 2017). To support tourism development, cooperation between the government, the private sector and the community (public, private, and community partnerships) is needed which can produce optimal and profitable tourism development equality, is needed between all parties who work together. In East Java provincial regulation number 6 of 2017 concerning the master plan for tourism development in the province of East Java for 2017-2032, in articles 45 and 46, it is explained that cooperation between the government, provincial government, district/city government, business world and local communities is carried out in order to: 1) Strengthening the structure of the tourism industry; 2) Increasing the competitiveness of the tourism industry; 3) Development of tourism business partnerships; and 4) Development of environmental responsibility.

Table 1. Top 5 favorite DTWs for domestic tourists in 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>DTW name</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Ponorogo Ngebel Lake</td>
<td>13.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Sarangan Magetan Lake</td>
<td>11.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Pacitan Klayar Beach</td>
<td>9.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Trenggalek Prigi Beach</td>
<td>6.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Teleng Ria Pacitan Beach</td>
<td>4.99%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: East Java Tourism Office (2018)

According to Table 1 above, Ngebel Ponorogo Lake is ranked first in the category of the Top 5 Favorite Tourist Destinations for domestic tourists in 2018 with a percentage of 13.02%. Ngebel Lake is the only natural or ecotourism lake in Ponorogo Regency and is the main destination when visiting Ponorogo. Its existence also functions as a source of water for the surrounding community and creates an ecosystem of various flora and fauna that live around the lake. There is also cultural tourism, which is a routine activity every year on 1 suru or new year hijriyah (Islamic calendar) in Ngebel Lake, namely the ritual of Larung Sesaji and Minutes of Prayer at Ngebel Lake. As a means of showing gratitude to God and efforts to strengthen ties between people. This Sesaji Larung activity is also an attraction at Ngebel Lake.

In fact, the tourism potential of Ngebel Lake has not yet been developed to its full potential, with slow progress and minimal development of tourist objects, such as the lack of wide roads leading to the lake, the lack of parking space for vehicles, the lack of quality accommodation, and the many local people who use the lake as ponds for raising fish and fishing, which is uncomfortable for tourists who want to see the beauty of the lake, also causes a reduction in the faunal ecosystem in the lake. And in the development of Ngebel Lake tourism, the government, private sector and community have collaborated in increasing tourism in their area, but this effort has not been able to increase the number of domestic tourists from 150.054 visitors in 2019 to 170.638 tourists in 2020. Meanwhile, foreign tourists tend to decrease or fluctuate every year, it means that the promotion and marketing of tourist objects and attractions are not considered effective and creative. This is because the local government does not respond to the importance of a regional development planning cooperation network, so many foreign tourists do not know about the tourism potential in Ponorogo Regency, especially Ngebel Lake tourism in Ponorogo Regency.

With this problem, it is necessary for the government to establish partnerships with other stakeholders, one of the things that cannot be avoided in developing tourism is budgeting needs. In developing tourism objects, it requires a lot of money because tourist attractions are places where tourists gather to relieve fatigue, so they are required to maximize the facilities and infrastructure needed by tourists while traveling. The partnership is run by the government of Ponorogo Regency with two other stakeholders, namely the Moroccan
International Group Of Development, Technologies And Construction Companies (GDTC) and the Ngebel Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS). Collaboration with the private sector, namely GDTC, was only established in May 2021. The involvement of the business world (private sector) and the community in tourism development is very supportive of achieving the big goals of Good Governance.

Group Of Development, Technologies, and Construction Companies (GDTC) International Morocco is a Moroccan international company engaged in technology and construction. The MoU between the Government of Ponorogo Regency and GTDC International is an investment collaboration worth IDR 754 billion. In detail, Rp. 200 billion for the construction of the Reyog museum, Rp 100 billion for the fertilizer factory, Rp 174 billion for the development of an integrated agricultural area, Rp 180 billion for the construction of the pouring factory and Rp 100 billion for the development of Ngebel tourism itself. In the future, Ngebel Lake will be used for modern tourism, including the construction of a dancing fountain and a cable car with more modern technology.

The implementation of the Partnership will run as expected, inseparable from the role of each party collaborating with one another (Indahsari et al., 2022; Tamrin & Lubis, 2023). The Culture and Sports Tourism Office has a role as a facilitator, guide, and regulator, which means the District Government as a policymaker, provides legalization, and convenience for the community. Conduct coaching through training, and seminars, providing guidelines and standards for homestay outreach, tour guides, marketing, promotion and the home industry. Then the role of the Ngebel POKDARWIS is as an object, an implementer of policies made by the Regional Government, a community group that drives tourism awareness, and a controller of the performance of the Regional Government. The Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS) is an institution at the community level whose members are tourism actors who have concern and responsibility and play a role in driving the development of tourism and the realization of Sapta Pesona (www.kemenparekraf.go.id).

The author is interested in discussing cooperation regarding tourism, especially in this case regarding the Public, Private, and Community Partnership (PPCP) in the development of Ngebel Lake tourism by the Ponorogo Regency Government with the Group Of Development, Technologies, and Construction Companies (GDTC) International Morocco and the Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS) Ngebel because it is the first collaboration in Ponorogo with foreign parties and is a collaboration carried out to fix the problems that exist in the Ngebel Lake tourism area.

RESEARCH METHODS

The type of this research is descriptive with a qualitative approach, in which data and facts are written in the form of words or pictures and contain quotations of data (facts) revealed in the field. In addition, the researcher intends to understand the social situation in the field in depth. The context of this research is the role of the Public-Private Community Partnership (PPCP) in the development of tourism in Ngebel, Ponorogo Regency.

The writer uses purposive sampling, where the author has determined samples or sources that match the criteria for knowing about tourism development partnerships in Ngebel Lake, Ponorogo Regency. In this study, researchers use structured interviews with informants who have been addressed or selected, namely the head of the Ponorogo Regency Tourism Culture and Sports Office, the Promotion and Cooperation section, the Tourism Industry Development section, and the Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS) Ngebel Lake Ponorogo. The interview method used to strengthen and clarify the data obtained is:

1. Regarding the role of each stakeholder
2. Tourism development facilities
3. Collaboration that has been approved by each stakeholder
4. Obstacles in tourism development and how to overcome them

This research was conducted by the author using overt and covert observation techniques with the heads of the Ponorogo Regency Tourism Culture and Sports Office, the Promotion and Cooperation Section, the Tourism Industry Development Section and the Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS) Telaga Ngebel Ponorogo and the tourism spot of Ngebel Ponorogo Lake. Where the resource persons will know from the beginning to the end about
the research activities. However, at one point the researcher was not forthright or disguised in his observations, which avoided any data being sought that would be confidential. The types of data collected during the observation process include developments in the Ngebel Lake tourism area.

The author uses the document method by collecting materials related to the problem under study to obtain the desired data, utilizing data in the form of books, and notes (documentation) that have been published en masse in various media that can be accessed freely by the public. The document method is needed to obtain data regarding policy documents and partnership agreements between the Ponorogo government and the Group Of Development, Technologies and Construction Companies (GDTC) International Morocco.

The triangulation method chosen by the author in this research is source triangulation by re-checking data through various sources, especially informants, so that the data that has been analyzed by the researcher produces a further conclusion to ask for agreement and check the data with the data source, so the results from these various sources will be described and categorized according to the owner of the same view, different views, and specifications.

The data analysis technique that the writer will use is an inductive qualitative data analysis technique, which is based on the data obtained and then developed into a hypothesis. Here the author uses a data analysis model in the field according to Miles and Huberman, 1984. Miles, M.B., Huberman, A.M. and Saldana, 2014 suggest that activities in analyzing qualitative data are carried out interactively and continue continuously until complete so that the data is saturated (Sugiyono, 2018).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Ngebel Lake Tourism

Ngebel Lake is a naturally formed lake located in Ngebel District, Ponorogo Regency. Ngebel Lake is located 23 kilometers from the city center, or 40 minutes drive. Located on the slopes of Mount Wilis at an altitude of 734 meters above sea level (masl), it has a lake area of up to 150 hectares surrounded by 2 kilometers of paved roads. Making Ngebel Lake the most popular natural tourist spot in Ponorogo.

Based on Law Number 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism in the Ponorogo Regency Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW) 2012-2032, the Ngebel Lake Tourism Area is one of the tourist attractions to enjoy this type of travel tourism with beautiful scenery and a unique culinary tour. Ngebel Lake is managed directly by the Department of Culture, Tourism, Youth and Sports (DISBUDPARPORA) in Ponorogo Regency. Ngebel Lake is located in Ngebel District, which has eight villages in it.

Ngebel Lake is a mainstay of tourism in Ponorogo Regency because it has greenish lake water and is still well maintained. Ngebel Lake, which was not optimal at first, remains a mainstay of tourism in Ponorogo Regency. Several objects for the construction of facilities, and infrastructure, along with other supporting facilities that add to the attractiveness of visitors have begun to be developed. Over time, the introduction and promotion of Ngebel Lake tourism were carried out by the Ponorogo Regency government, mainly the main manager, namely the Ponorogo Regency DISBUDPARPORA, which was assisted by 16 media partners and the community both online and through word of mouth, so that it produced results. Efforts made with the aim of developing are starting to look like the setting of tourist entrance fees, the erection of the Reog Ponorogo monument, the Baru Klinting statue, the identity monument of the Ngebel Lake tourist attraction, gazebos, "Nyai Lattung" boat facilities, "duck-bebekan" water bicycle facilities, speed boat facilities, a gate to enter the Ngebel Lake Tourism Area, public toilets, places of worship, health infrastructure, and also lodging. These things are slowly being developed by the Regional Government for Ngebel Lake Tourism in order to attract tourists.

Ngebel Lake tourism has also been supported by other tours in the area where the tour is inherited from the ancestors, namely Larung Sesaji, which is carried out in commemoration of Grebeg Suro (Night 1 Suro), or Islamic New Year to be exact once a year. Not only
Larung Sesaji, but there are other natural attractions located in the Ngebel Lake Tourism Area, such as Widodaren Waterfall, Toyomerto Waterfall, Gondowido Waterfall, Tirto Husodo Hot Spring, Tiga Rasa Water Source, Mloko Sewu, Tapak Bima, Ngebel Adventure Park (NAP), and Mini Zoo. Ngebel Lake is mostly visited by domestic tourists both from within and outside Ponorogo Regency to enjoy the view, take pictures, and also enjoy durian fruit and grilled tilapia, which are one of the characteristics of Ngebel Lake. The number of visitors to Ngebel Lake Tourism is increasing every day, especially on holidays, which can make the number of visitors very high compared to the usual day, both young people and families.

As the author described in the previous chapter, development programs, especially in the tourism sector, cannot run well without the partnerships that are established in them. In developing tourism, partnerships between the government, the private sector and the community are established in order to achieve a common goal. The requirements and basis for conducting a partnership are based on the principle of a win-win solution where each partner must get mutual benefits from conducting a partnership. This statement is in accordance with the author's research regarding tourism development partnerships between the government, the private sector and the community in the development of Ngebel Lake tourism, Ponorogo Regency.

One development effort carried out by the Ponorogo government was cooperating with the private sector, namely GDTC and the Ngebel Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS) in the development of Ngebel Lake tourism. Tourism development targets an increasing number of visitors by adding dancing fountains or water fountains, cable cars, building stands, building panel or control houses, and procuring electric transformers. This Ngebel Lake tourism development will be analyzed in the sub-chapter using the Public Private Community Partnership (PPCP) theory by S. Thomas Ng et al., (2012) which will later be strengthened by the characteristics of successful partnerships by Jakki Mohr and Robert Spekman (2016), which are described as follows:

a. Public Partners / Government

The government is one of the stakeholders involved in the PPCP. The government plays an important role in policymaking and finding partners in partnership. The government as a public service is to meet the interests and needs of the community and carry out government, development and social affairs. As is the case with the Ponorogo Regency government as the executor of the Ngebel Lake tourism development program to facilitate visitors and the community around tourist attractions. The development was carried out by the Ponorogo government in collaboration with the private sector, namely the Group Of Development Technologies And Construction Companies (GDTC) International Morocco, and the community or POKDARWIS Ngebel. The government's role in the PPCP partnership in the development of Ngebel Lake tourism is as a regulator, facilitator and budget planner, which
the author can describe in the following indicators:

1) **Regulator (Tourism policymaker)**

Regulators or policymakers in this case are regulations or a policy that regulate and bind a certain group or community based on a goal with a mutual. In the Ngebel Lake tourism development partnership, the government of Ponorogo Regency and the Group Of Development Technology Agreement gives And Construction Companies (GDTC) International Morocco strengthened by the existence of an agreement document in the form of an MoU which contains cooperation agreements for development in the tourism, agriculture and infrastructure sectors. In the tourism sector, the focus will be on developing the Ngebel Lake tourist area. The Ngebel tourism development partnership agreement was signed by two parties, namely the Ponorogo Regency Government and the Group of Development Technologies And Construction Companies (GDTC) International Morocco. The MoU was only signed by two parties because it was only limited to financing. Despite the existence of the MoU, the government's role was not fully optimal; the government let the GDTC go away because of the regency government's slowness in processing the requirements, namely the creation of regional bodies. In the absence of legal regulations or laws that only contain cooperation established between the Ponorogo Regency Government, the Group of Development Technologies And Construction Companies (GDTC) International Morocco and POKDARWIS Ngebel in the development of Ngebel Lake, each stakeholder does not have clear management in partnering and being an effective collaboration and not an official.

2) **Facilitator**

The government as a facilitator is capable of creating conducive conditions for the implementation of development and bridging various community interests in optimizing development. In developing Ngebel Lake tourism, the Ponorogo Regency government acts as a facilitator by providing training and improving the skills provided to the Ngebel POKDARWIS, which will later be passed on to the community or communities in the Ngebel Lake area. The government plays a role in facilitating what the community needs around the Ngebel Lake tourist spot through POKDARWIS which will later be forwarded to the community or people around the tour. The Regency Government will cooperate with POKDARWIS to organize a training program or the government will provide training to POKDARWIS which will later transfer the knowledge to the community. The facilities provided by the government are not only training facilities but also public facilities provided to provide comfort and convenience for tourists. The district government apart from providing training facilities for MSMEs and hotels in collaboration with POKDARWIS also provides public facilities in the form of infrastructure facilities, which will later be built in 2023 and handed over to POKDARWIS Ngebel for management.

3) **Budget Planning**

Guaranteeing the continuity of cooperation requires financing management, which is used as a reference in managing and allocating funds in the process of developing the tourism sector. Sources of funds originating from the central government, the private sector and the community must be used effectively. In this case, the development of the Ngebel Lake tourism sector requires sources of funds and maximization in allocating these funds. The partnership between the Government of Ponorogo and Group Development Technology and Construction International Marocco in the development of the Ngebel Lake tourist area has a source of funds to support the implementation of the development, which initially came from the partnership fund of Group Development Technology and Construction International Marocco in 2021. The development budget is in the memorandum of understanding or MoU of Rp 100 billion, with details of the budget that have been explained as follows:
Based on Table 2, the budget allocated for the development of the Ngebel tourist area is IDR 100 billion. The funds were provided by the Group Development Technology and Construction International Morocco with a return of payment within a pre-agreed period. The collaboration that exists between the Ponorogo Regency Government and GDTC Morocco is a B2B or business to business collaboration, which is a form of transaction between companies. So the money given will later go to the Regional Company (PD) Sari Gunung Ponorogo and later PD Sari Gunung Ponorogo together with the Regency Government will create a regionally owned public agency (BUMD), which later the collaboration can run. Funding from the Moroccan GDTC has not been able to be established because the Regency Government, until 2023 has not created a BUMD for the development of Ngebel Lake tourism using APBD funds.

Based on Table 3, the budget that has been set reaches a total of 6 billion from APBD funds, the facility that was built in 2023, namely the Water Fountain has spent 3.5 billion in funds, while other facilities are still in the planning process. The budget that was not in accordance with the plans made with GDTC Morocco made the construction of the Water Fountain smaller and not as expected. Can make the Water Fountain in the middle of the Lake but due to a lack of funds, the Water Fountain is located on the edge of the lake and is not wide. From the budget problems that are not in accordance with the plan, the authors conclude that the nominal budget greatly influences the construction of facilities.

### Table 2.
Details of the Budget for the Development of the Ngebel Lake Tourism Area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dancing Fountain / Water Fountain</td>
<td>20 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cable car</td>
<td>16 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stand building</td>
<td>1.2 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repair and Widening of Highway Access</td>
<td>45 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facility Repair</td>
<td>17.8 Billion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed by the author (2023)

### Table 3.
Details of the budget set for the development of Ngebel Lake tourism using APBD funds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Construction of Water Fountains</td>
<td>3.5 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of the Tribune Area</td>
<td>1 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of Panel or Control Houses</td>
<td>760 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procurement of Electric Travo</td>
<td>1.5 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Funds</td>
<td>6 Billion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed by the author (2023)

b. Private Partner

In developing Ngebel Lake tourism, the Ponorogo Regency government synergizes with the Group Development Technology and Construction International Morocco and the Ngebel POKDARWIS. The private sector acts as an investor or in other words provides capital to carry out development in the tourism development sector, which has been previously agreed with the government. Investment from the private sector is expected to be able to cover the budget issued by the government. Private parties or GDTC Morocco provide funds of 100 billion for the development of Ngebel Lake tourism. With details of the agreed funds. With such a large budget, we should be able to develop better and maximize tourism in Ngebel Lake so that the number of tourists who come will increase. However, if the use of funds is not optimized, the development will not be able to run properly.
c. Community
The development of Ngebel Lake Tourism in Ponorogo Regency includes the community and is called the Ngebel Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS). As a tourism area community, POKDARWIS Ngebel plays an active role in managing Ngebel Lake tourism in collaboration with the district government.

d. Characteristics of Partnership Success
Partnership in development does not always run smoothly, there must be obstacles. To know the success of developing partnerships, indicators that can be measured are needed. The existence of these indicators determines whether partners are interdependent and their willingness to work for the continuity of the relationship. In the implementation of partnerships, there are challenges and obstacles, of course, disrupting the harmony of partnerships. Therefore, we need measuring tools to determine the success of the Partnership Attributes, as follows:

1) Commitment
Looking at the level of cooperation between local governments and partners, it is known that for the common good, it is agreed with a binding agreement (contract). However, in reality, the Ngebel Lake development partnership between the district government and GDTC Morocco does not yet have a strong commitment. The government is indifferent to partners by not implementing its commitment to make BUMD a condition for partnering. Therefore, in a partnership, there needs to be commitment and the ability to work hard and seriously in carrying out tasks. Therefore, in the partnership carried out by the Ponorogo Regency Government and GDTC Morocco, it is necessary to increase commitment at the beginning of the collaboration with the aim of not changing future cooperation.

2) Communication Behavior
It shows that the partnership must have effective communication, including the quality of information, information sharing and participation in goals and planning. Communication behavior encourages the Ponorogo Regency Government and the Moroccan GDTC to interact, which influences each other, through intentional or unintentional actions and is not limited to verbal and nonverbal communication.

3) Conflict Resolution Techniques
Conflicts often occur in organizational relationships because of the inherent interdependence between parties. The impact of conflict resolution on relationships can be productive or detrimental. Thus, the way in which each partner resolves conflict has implications for the success of the partnership. When the parties are involved in solving a problem together, there will be a solution. The problem regarding the non-performance of the partnership according to the signing of the MoU that occurred in the Ponorogo Regency Government partnership with GDTC Morocco has not yet been resolved, and there has been no settlement so that the partnership can run according to the MoU.
CONCLUSION

Based on the results of research on public, private, and community partnerships that exist between the Government of Ponorogo Regency, the Moroccan International Group Of Development, Technologies and Construction Companies (GDTC) and the Ngebel Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS), it is concluded that The Ponorogo Regency Government during the implementation of the development has carried out its role quite well by drawing up a memorandum of understanding or MoU for the development of Ngebel Lake tourism, budgeting funds according to the development program and providing facilities in the form of facilities for development purposes. However, the government is still having problems carrying out its role because, in the budget that was initially submitted by the private sector, it switches to using the APBD budget with the problem that the government does not immediately make BUMD a requirement for disbursement of funds from the private sector, The Moroccan International Group of Development, Technologies and Construction Companies (GDTC) as an investor has not gone well. It was found that the Moroccan GDTC had not disbursed the funds on the grounds that the government had not completed the requirements for partnering and the problems faced in running the partnership by the Ponorogo Regency Government have not been successful where there are characteristics underlying the failure, namely commitment, information sharing, and participation which need to be resolved by conflict resolution.

THANKS TO

We would like to thank the Head of the Ponorogo Regency Culture and Sports Tourism Service, Promotion and Cooperation section; Tourism Industry Development section, and the Ngebel Lake Ponorogo Tourism Awareness Group (POKDARWIS) who have helped the author complete this research.
REFERENCES


**Conflict of Interest Statement:** The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright ©2023 Niikmatus Sholikhah, M. Husni Tamrin. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.